

La Sapienza

Revisione esterna tesi dott. HOWARD ROBERT COASE (37 ciclo)**COASE HOWARD ROBERT**

Wydział Humanistyczny
Starszy specjalista
w Biurze Ewaluacji i Obsługi Instytutów
Kardynała Konieczna-Montak

UNIwersytet Śląski
w KATOWICACH
Wydział Humanistyczny
41-200 Sosnowiec
gen. Stefana Grot-Roweckiego 5

Evaluation form for PhD dissertation

Evaluation form

Title of the thesis

“A viable breathing substance”: the poetics of atmosphere in the work of Barbara Guest

Affiliation of the reviewer

Institut für Romanische Sprachen und Literaturen, Goethe-Universität Frankfurt am Main
Honorary Faculty Research Fellow, Faculty of Medieval and Modern Languages, University
of Oxford

Report

I read with great interest Howard Coase's thesis "A viable breathing substance": the poetics of atmosphere in the work of Barbara Guest', which re-examines Barbara Guest's entire poetic career by paying attention to the 'poetics of atmosphere' that animates her writing and characterises her poetic texts. Through a careful balance of close readings of individual poems, analysis of archival materials that illuminate their context, and awareness of the critical and theoretical debates about both modernism and the concept of atmosphere, the thesis succeeds in its aim to move beyond the critical categories with which Guest's work has been read, to bring her work into productive dialogue with various approaches in the field of affect theory, and to reconsider her position in relation to the New York School. Apart from some typos (including, on p. 236, Olaf Eliasson for Olafur Eliasson), the thesis is written with extreme clarity and precision. The intense signposting effectively guides the reader even through particularly dense and theoretically complex moments of the argument, which never loses sight of its object of analysis.

The only suggestion I would make, but it is really only a suggestion, is to delve a little deeper into some of the more general issues in order to hint, at least briefly, at the wider implications of the study. For example, beginning on pp. 3-4, questions of 'lyric', 'lyric address', 'lyric identification', and 'lyric subjectivity' recur throughout the thesis, sometimes in a general perspective (as in the reference to Jonathan Culler's 'Theory of the Lyric' on p. 38, note 13) and sometimes in the context of the specific modernist suspicion of a particular nineteenth-century idea of the lyric (as in 1.III). In the conclusion, where the question of the 'lyric address' reappears in connection with its 'deictic coordinates' (p. 224), its relation to the problem of representation could be better clarified with references to the current debate in lyric studies.

Confidential report (it will not be shown to the candidate)

Evaluation file (optional)

Presentation and clarity

None Poor Average Good Excellent

The reviewer should be able to read the text without difficulty. This implies that the dissertation is clear and 'user friendly', without duplications or repetitions.

Integration and coherence

None Poor Average Good Excellent

The manuscript should present logical and rational links between different parts of the thesis.

Introduction to scientific background

None Poor Average Good Excellent

The text should contain a satisfactory introduction to the scientific background which is relevant to the research, preparing the reader to the exposition of the problem.

Review of relevant literature

None Poor Average Good Excellent

The candidate must have a detailed knowledge of original sources, have a thorough knowledge of the field, and understand the main theoretical and methodological issues.

Statement of research problem

None Poor Average Good Excellent

A clear statement of the research problem should be made, together with specific hypotheses, predictions, or questions which the research is designed to address.

Originality

None Poor Average Good Excellent

The research must be the candidate's own work. The degree of independence may vary according to the research topic.

Contribution to knowledge and scientific relevance

None Poor Average Good Excellent

The dissertation should be substantial enough to be able to form the basis of two articles on refereed journal, a book or research monograph.

Mastery of the English language

None Poor Average Good Excellent

The candidate must be proficient in written English and show mastery of appropriate scientific/technical language.

The thesis can be considered for a 'cum laude' award

Yes No

A major goal of the review process is to evaluate if the present version of the thesis is:

- 1) adequate as is
- 2) require minor revision
- 3) require major revision

for admission of the candidate to the defense of the work in front of a national evaluation board.

Accept as is Minor revision Major revision

Date: 12/14/2024

Reviewer: Giusti Francesco